

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Friday, the 14<sup>th</sup> December 2012** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member

Invitees:

Shri I. S. Chahal, Member Secretary and Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Govt. of Maharashtra and Dr. A.S. Vyas, Member could not attend the meeting. Hence, leave of absence granted.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1: To confirm and approve the Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Monday the 26<sup>th</sup> November 2012 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051**

The Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Monday the 26<sup>th</sup> November 2012 at 11.00 a.m. at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai - 400 051 are confirmed and approved, subject to following correction:-

**Item No. 4(a) – Page No. 11 to be read as:-**

*"Considered the letter dated 7<sup>th</sup> November 2012 received from Dr. K.R. Shetty, Hon'ble Member of the Samiti wishing to resign membership due to his ill health especially as he was unable to remain present, because of his ill health for nearly four meetings in the past. His resignation is accepted. Samiti appreciates his valuable contribution.*

*Dr. Snehalata Deshmukh, Hon'ble Member of the Samiti has suggested the name of Dr. A.S. Vyas, Associate Professor, Grant Medical College, Mumbai. It is further stated by her that he can be of great help to us as Government data can be available with him.*



*In view of the above the Samiti accepts and resolves the name of Dr. A.S. Vyas as a Member of the Samiti."*

**Item No. 4(b) – Page No. 11 to be read as:-**

*"The Samiti decides to re-audit at least five Colleges every year through independent C.A. / Auditor wherever any doubt arises in respect of the fee proposals submitted by it. And if any doubt is found to be appropriate then any Hon'ble Member along with one Auditor/Chartered Accountant to visit the said college to verify the expenses thereof to be borne by the Samiti and the members of the visiting team shall be entitled to travel either by air (economy class) or by second class Ac (by train). They shall also be entitled to the other benefits as per the Government norms. The fee to be finally approved after the said process is over."*

**Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting including meeting held on 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2012.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on Monday, the 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2012, the details of the same are as follows:

<b>Meeting on 26<sup>th</sup> Nov. 2012</b>	<b>Actionable Points</b>	<b>Action taken</b>
Item No. 1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b><u>29/11/2012.</u></b>
Item No.2 a) & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2012-13.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b><u>29/11/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 3	To decide on the proposals received for approval of fee structure for the courses started during AY 2012-13: To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. (a) To consider and decide on proposals where (b) discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes, (c) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed to the colleges/institutes. (d) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are not cleared by the colleges/institutes. (e) To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & Notice Board on <b><u>29/11/2012.</u></b>

Meeting on 26 <sup>th</sup> Nov. 2012	Actionable Points	Action taken
Item No. 4(a)	To consider and decide on letter dated 7th November 2012 received from Dr. K. R. Shetty, Hon'ble member asking for relieving from membership of Samiti.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on & Notice Board on <u>29/11/2012</u> . Decision is conveyed to the Hon'ble Members by a separate letter dated <u>1/12/2012</u> .
Item No. 4(b)	To deliberate, discuss & decide about the random verification (re-audit) of certain colleges from different streams.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on & Notice Board on <u>29/11/2012</u> .
Item No. 5(a)	To consider and decide on letter requesting for permission to submit the proposal after cut off date from the following colleges:-  1) Godavari Shikshan Prasarak Mandal, Rahati (Bu.), Tal. Dist. Nanded.  2) Dharti School of Nursing, A/p. Taroda, (Kh.), Nanded.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on & Notice Board on <u>29/11/2012</u> . Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges by a separate letter dated <u>1/12/2012</u> .
Item No. 5(b)	To consider and decide on letter dated 1st November 2012 received from Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding Irrational hike in tuition fees of Dr. Panjabrao Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati accompanied by a letter from the Office of Secretary to the Governor No. MUHS.38/12/D/3792 dated 15th Oct. 2012 along with the complaint letter from Shri S. P. Sarnaik, Chairman Parents Asso. Dr. Panjabrao Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati dated 3rd October 2012.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on & Notice Board on <u>29/11/2012</u> . Decision is conveyed to the respective college by a separate letter dated <u>1/12/2012</u> .
Item No. 6	Any other Item with the permission of the Chair.	There was no item.

Samiti noted it.



**Item No. 2(b): To review disposal of work – Present Scenario for Academic Year 2012-13.**

- i) Chart showing No. of fees approval proposals received from the Institutes of Health Science Courses/Institutes for Academic Year 2012-13.

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2011-12)	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2012-13)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2012-13)
						Under Scrutinized	Verified by C.A.	No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	11	11	0	0	0	1	Rs.496120/-
2	Medical/MBBS	11	10	10	0	0	0	1	Rs.330750/-
3	PG Dental	15	14	13	1	0	1	1	Rs.176400/-
4	BDS	22	20	19	1	1	0	2	Rs.148840/-
5	PG- Ayurved	12	12	12	0	0	0	0	Rs.99220/-
6	Ayurved	40	39	38	1	1	0	1	Rs.77180/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	12	12	0	0	0	2	Rs.66150/-
8	Homeopathic	45	40	40	0	0	0	5	Rs.44100/-
9	Physiotherapy	21	18	18	0	0	0	3	Rs.46300/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	8	7	6	1	1	0	1	Rs.60640/-
11	Occupational Therapy	2			0	0	0	2	Rs.38590/-
12	P.G. Occupational Therapy	1			0	0	0	1	Rs.55120/-
13	PG - Unani	4			0	0	0	4	Rs.55120/-
14	Unani	6	3	1	2	2	0	3	Rs.46300/--
15	BASLP	2	1	1	0	0	0	1	Rs.49610/-
16	M.Sc. Nursing	7	7	7	0	0	0	0	Rs.55120/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	19	19	18	1	1	0	0	Rs.49610/-
18	B.Sc. Nursing	49	49	46	3	3	0	0	Rs.44100/-
19	RANM Nursing	388	388	74	314	252	62	0	Rs. 36750/-

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2011-12)	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2012-13)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2012-13)
						Under Scrutinized	Verified by C.A.	No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	
20	RGNM Nursing	143	143	30	113	92	21	0	Rs. 36750/-
21	Dental Hygienist				0	0		0	Rs. 15750/-
22	Dental Mechanic				0	0		0	Rs.15750/-
	<b>Total</b>	<b>821</b>	<b>793</b>	<b>356</b>	<b>437</b>	<b>353</b>	<b>84</b>	<b>28</b>	

Samiti noted it.

- ii) Pendency of Revision of Applications for the month ending November 2012 for the Academic Year 2012-13.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	MD/MS (PG)	0	0	0
2	Medical/MBBS	1	0	1
3	PG Dental	2	0	2
4	BDS	3	0	3
5	PG- Ayurved	0	0	0
6	Ayurved	0	0	0
7	PG. Homeopathic	1	0	1
8	Homeopathic	0	0	0
9	Physiotherapy	1	0	1
10	MP-TH (PG.-Physiotherapy)	0	0	0
11	Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
12	P.G. Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
13	PG - Unani	0	0	0
14	Unani	0	0	0

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
15	BASLP	0	0	0
16	M.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0
18	B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0
19	RANM Nursing	0	0	0
20	RGNM Nursing	1	0	1
21	Dental Hygienist	0	0	0
22	Dental Mechanic	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>		<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>9</b>

Samiti noted it.

- iii) Pendency of Revision of Applications for the month ending November 2012 for the Academic Year 2011-12.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	R.A.N.M.	01	0	01

Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3:** **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2012-13:**

**Item No. 3(a) :** **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2012-13 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2012-13 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**MDS/BDS**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	BDS0005	M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences & Research Centre, Pune	200000	<b>180000</b>	199427

**R.A.N.M.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RANM	Late Raghunathraoji Kendre Nursing School, Parli Vajjnath.	35000/- (Ad-hoc) (50000 Collect Fees)	<b>75000 for 1 ½ Years</b>	82217
2	RANM	S.R.V.Nursing College Dawki, Gondia	60000	<b>66000 for 1 Year</b>	79033

**R.G.N.M.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RGNM	Yeola Nursing School RGNM, Nashik	<b>35000 FY</b> <b>65000 SY Onwards</b>	<b>65000</b>	<b>70295</b>

**Item No. 3(b) : To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2012-13 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2012-13 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**R.A.N.M.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RANM	Bhakti Institute of Nursing, Pandharpur, Solapur	65000 (Collect fees)	<b>60000</b> <b>for 1 Year</b>	65000 for 1 year
2	RANM	S.S.S.P.M.College of Nursing, Barshi, Solapur	40250 (Collect fees)	<b>40250</b>	55000 for 1 year
3	RANM	Nav Yuva Nursing School, Bhandara	<b>35000 FY</b>	<b>65000</b>	78026 for 1 year

**Note :** *R.A.N.M. course is of 1 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fee for 1 year can be charged wherever it is mentioned for 1 year collected fee.*

**Note :** *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 3 years can be charged.*

The following Colleges/Institutes teaching R.A.N.M. and R.G.N.M. course are before the Samiti for finalisation of fees for Academic Year 2012-13, but it is not possible to approve their fees for Academic Year 2012-13 as Government resolution for permission to 2012-13 course has been not issued by the Government of Maharashtra. In those cases, however we know that permission is granted by Indian Nursing Council, New Delhi and Maharashtra Nursing Council, Mulund, Mumbai. List of those Colleges/Institutes are as under:

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute
1	RANM	Aakar School of Nursing , Nagpur
2	RANM	Aurangabad Nursing School, Aurangabad
3	RANM	Creative Nursing School, Gadhinglaj, Kolhapur
4	RANM	D.P.Nursing School & Research Institute , Seloo,Wardha
5	RANM	Dindori Nursing School , Dindori, Nashik
6	RANM	Florence School of Nursing, Gadhinglaj, Kolhapur



Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute
7	RANM / & RGNM	Gulabrao Patil Memorial Trust, Institute of Nursing Science, Miraj
8	RANM	Jalna Nursing School RANM, Badnapur, Jalna
9	RANM	Late Anusaya Savitri Manikrao Thakrao School of Nursing , Maval, Pune
10	RANM	MAM's Institute of Nursing Education, Hadapsar, Pune
11	RANM	Matoshree Hirai Deshmukh Nursing Institute , Shirala, Sangli
12	RANM	Navjivan School of Nursing , Shahapur, Thane
13	RANM	Pad. Dr. V.V.P's Institute of Nursing Education, Ahmednagar
14	RANM	S.G. Nursing School, Latur
15	RANM	Sai Nursing School, Rahata, Ahmednagar
16	RANM	Sai Nursing School, Shevgaon, Ahmednagar
17	RANM	Saraswati Nursing School, Junnar, Pune
18	RANM	Savitribai Phule Nursing School Kannad, Aurangabad
19	RANM	Sharda Nursing School , Khapa, Bhandara
20	RANM / RGNM	Shree Vithalrao Joshi Charitable Trust's Smarth Nursing College, Chiplun, Ratnagiri
21	RANM	Smt. Sumitrabai Thakare Training College of Nursing, Yavatmal
22	RANM	Tirumalla R.A.N.M. Nursing School, Jalkot, Latur
23	RANM	Uma Institute of Nursing Education, Jath, Sangli
24	RANM / GNM	Yashodhara Nursing Institute , Solapur
25	RANM	Kamlabai Umak Nursing School, Amravati
26	RANM	Deonil School of Nursing, Mul, Chandrapur
27	RANM	G.S. Nursing School, Bhandara
28	RANM	Gondia Nursing College , Gondia
29	RANM	Gurumauli Institute of Nursing Science, Amravati



Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute
30	RANM	Indira Bahuuddeshiya Shikshan Santha A.N.M.Nursing School, Malkapur,Buldana
31	RANM	Indira Gandhi Nursing School, Parner, Ahmedngar
32	RANM	Jay Institute of Nursing , Indapur, Pune
33	RANM	Kalwan Nursing School, Kalwan, Nashik
34	RANM / RGNM	Kranti Nursing School,Ahmednagar
35	RANM	Krantinagar G.D. (Bapu) Lad Institute of Nursing,Sangli
36	RANM	Late Bhawandas T. Chhabada School of Nursing, Satara
37	RANM	Late Narayandas Bhawandas Chhabada School of Nursing Jaoli, Satara
38	RANM	Kedari Redekar Nursing School, Gadhinglaj, Kolhapur
39	RANM / RGNM	MGM's Institute of Nursing Education,CIDCO, Aurangabad
40	RANM	Mother Teresa RANM Nursing Institute,Udgir, Latur
41	RANM	Parshuram Medical & Research Foundation,Sushila Nursing School, Daund, Pune
42	RANM	Pravara Medical Trust's School of Nursing, Shevgaon,Ahmedngar
43	RANM	Priyanka Gandhi Nursing School , Aurangabad
44	RANM	Rajai Nursing Institute of RANM, CIDCO, Nanded
45	RANM	S.M. Nursing School, Gondia
46	RANM	S.N.D.School of RANM Nursing , Yeola, Nashik
47	RANM	Sau.Hemlatabai Motilalji Patni Nursing College, Aurangabad
48	RANM	Shivrani Bane Nursing School ,Walva,Sangli
49	RANM	Shri Goraksha Nursing School ,Aurangabad
50	RANM	Smt.Indumati Ramchandra Deshmukh School of Nursing,Mayani,Satara
51	RANM	Smt.Shardaben Champaklal Nanavati Institute of Polytechnic School of Nursing, Matunga, Mumbai
52	RANM	Spandan Nursing School,Vaijapur, Aurangabad



<b>Sr. no.</b>	<b>Code No.</b>	<b>Name of the Institute</b>
53	RANM	Swami Vivekanand Sanstha's School of Nursing, Nashik
54	RANM	Tanishq School of Nursing, Nagpur
55	RANM	Shri Venkatesha Nursing School, Beed
56	RANM	Y.M.T.School of Nursing,Kharghar, Navi Mumbai
57	RANM	Yeola Nursing School ,Yeola, Nashik
58	RGNM	Global Healthcare Institute School of Nursing (RGNM), Nashik
59	RGNM	Holy Spirit Institute of Nursing Education, Andheri , Mumbai
60	RGNM	Kalvan Nursing School, Kalwan, Nashik
61	RGNM	M.H.F's School of Nursing, Sangmner
62	RGNM	M.V.P.S.Training College of Nursing, Adgaon, Nashik
63	RGNM	Mahatma Gandhi Mission's Floerence Nightingale Institute of Nursing Education, Komothe, Navi Mumbai
64	RGNM	Pravara Medical Trust's College of General Nursing,Loni , Rahata, Ahmedngar
65	RGNM	Shri Goraksha Nursing School,Aurangabad
66	RGNM	College of Nursing , Wanless Hospital , Miraj, Sangli
67	RGNM	Smt. Sumitrabai Thakare Training College of Nursing, Yavatmal
68	RGNM	Aurangabad Training School of Nursing R.G.N.M.,Aurangabad
69	RGNM	Dhanvatari RGNM Nursing School, Nashik
70	RGNM	Navjivan School of Nursing , Shahapur, Thane
71	RGNM	Pad.Dr. V.V.P's Institute of Nursing Education, Ahmednagar
72	RGNM	School of nursing Krishna Hospital & MRC,Karad, Satara
73	RGNM	YMT School of Nursing, Kharghar, Navi Mumbai

Fee to be approved after the Government resolution is issued and submitted to Samiti office. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration.



**Item No. 3(c): To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/Institutes.**

Nil

**Item No. 3(d): To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.**

Office to scrutinize and place the proposals before the Samiti in due course.

**Item No. 4: To consider the report received from M/s. P.V. Page & Co., Chartered Accountants regarding Internal Audit for A.Y. 2006-07.**

Samiti perused the report under reference.

Mr. P.V. Page, Proprietor of the said Company is not presented today and hence by this subject can not be considered by Samiti. In fact he was telephonically contacted Mrs. Sane, Desk Officer of the Samiti and he stated he would be present before the Samiti in the next meeting. His presence is required because certain objections were raised about the report. He may be asked to remain present on 9-01-2013 or 10-01-2013.

**Item No. 5: Any other matter with the permission to the Chair.**

**Item No. 5(a): To discuss and decide in regarding purchase of Laptops/Notebook for the Hon'ble Members of the Samiti.**

Samiti decides that, each Member to be provided by the office Notebook. It is made clear that any Member is common is both the Samitis then only one to be provided to him. It is also made clear that those who are Government officials and by virtue of that Member of Samiti shall not have this facility.

Samiti further decides that. It is to be retained by them so long they are Members of the Samiti and to be returned to the office after he ceases as Member.

**Item No. 5(b): Letters dated 27<sup>th</sup> November 2012 received from Ramkishna Nursing School, Aurangabad and Ajinkya Nursing School, Aurangabad requesting to accept fee approval proposal for Academic Year 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the letter under references.


Samiti decides that, it is not possible to accept the prayer made in it for accepting the proposals for the course started in 2012-13. The Colleges can charge Ad-hoc fees declared by the Samiti for Academic Year 2012-13 i.e. Rs. 36,750/- as a final fee for both R.A.N.M. and R.G.N.M. course for the Academic Year 2012-13. Hence the request made by the Colleges/Institutes is rejected.

**Item No.5(C): To discuss and decide in respect of display of worksheet on Samiti website.**

The Worksheet – Calculations sheets of those colleges whose fees have been finalized should also be published on official website of Samiti. That will help the parties to understand the basis on which the fees came to be finally arrived.

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Thursday the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2013 at 11.00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date: 17-12-12



**(P.S. PATANKAR)**  
**CHAIRMAN**