

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Thursday , the 22<sup>nd</sup> Janaury 2015** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

---

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Invitees:

Smt. Manisha Mhaskar Member Secretary and Principal Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. having additional charge of Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1: To approve and confirm minutes of Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Monday the 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2014 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Monday, 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2014 is approved and confirmed, subject to the following correction in item No. 3(a) BSCN Sr. No. 2, Page No 6, to be corrected as under:-



**BSCN**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute		Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
2	BSCN0013 RANM/ RGNM/ PBBSCN	The Yash Foundation's College of Nursing and Medical Research Institute, Ratnagiri	BSCN/PBSCN/ RANM/RGNM	30150	31658	<b>30150</b>	<b>35990</b>

**Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting held on 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2014.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2014, the details of the same are as follows:

Meeting of 22 <sup>nd</sup> December 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 22 <sup>nd</sup> December 2014.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b>24/12/2014</b> . The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b>24/12/2014</b> .
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2014-15.	
Item No. 3:	decide on the proposals received for approval of the fee structure for the courses started during AY 2014-15: a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. b) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>24/12/2014</b> .

Meeting of 22 <sup>nd</sup> December 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	pointed out and cleared by the Colleges/Institutes. c) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/ Institutes.	Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges , by a separate letter dated <b>29/12/2014.</b>
Item No. 4(i)	To consider and decide on the Affidavit dated 1/11/2014 received from Dr. Nitin Sancheti regarding incorrect tuition fees charged by PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar & also refund of tuition fees of 3 ½ years. (Ref: Item No. 5(a) of minutes 25/3/2014 & 20/5/2014).	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>24/12/2014.</b>
Item No. 4(ii)	To consider and decide on letter dated 23/10/2014 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Prathishthan Medical College responding to the letter dated 11/8/2014, raising certain queries..	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>24/12/2014.</b>

The Samiti noted it.

**Item No.2(b): To review disposal of work – present Scenario for Academic Year 2014- 15.**

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	11	12	12	0	0		0	Rs.557390/
2	Medical/MB BS	13	14	14	14	0	0		0	Rs.371590/
3	PG Dental	18	12	11	11	0	0	0	0	Rs.198180/

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
4	BDS	<b>25</b>	<b>20</b>	20	20	<b>0</b>	0	0	0	Rs.167220/-
5	PG- Ayurved	<b>14</b>	<b>10</b>	11	10	<b>1</b>	0	0	1	Rs.111470/-
6	Ayurved	<b>44</b>	<b>38</b>	38	37	<b>1</b>	0	0	1	Rs.86710/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	<b>14</b>	<b>10</b>	11	11	<b>0</b>	0		0	Rs.74320/-
8	Homeopathic	<b>45</b>	<b>42</b>	42	42	<b>0</b>	0		0	Rs.49550/-
9	Physiotherapy	<b>22</b>	<b>19</b>	19	19	<b>0</b>	0	0	0	Rs.52020/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	<b>22</b>	<b>2</b>	6	6	<b>0</b>	0	0	0	Rs.68130/-
11	Occupational Therapy	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>	0		<b>0</b>	0			Rs.43350/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	0		<b>0</b>	0			Rs.61930/-
13	PG - Unani	<b>4</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1	<b>0</b>	0		0	Rs.61930/-
14	Unani	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	3	2	<b>1</b>	0	1	0	Rs.52020/-
15	BASLP	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>	0		<b>0</b>	0			Rs.55730/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	<b>13</b>	<b>11</b>	11	11	<b>0</b>	0	0		Rs.61930/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	<b>27</b>	<b>28</b>	24	24	<b>0</b>	0	0	0	Rs.55730/-
18	B.Sc.Nursing	<b>52</b>	<b>61</b>	58	57	<b>1</b>	0		1	Rs.49550/-
19	DMLT(After B.Sc.)	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	0		<b>0</b>	0			Rs.52500/-
20	RANM Nursing	<b>605</b>	<b>408</b>	407	398	<b>9</b>	0	0	9	Rs.41290/-

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
21	RGNM Nursing	220	175	170	164	6	0	3	3	Rs.41290/-
22	Dental Hygienist						0			Rs.17690/-
23	Dental Mechanic						0			Rs.17690/-
	<b>Total</b>	<b>1162</b>	<b>865</b>	<b>858</b>	<b>839</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>15</b>	
								<b>19</b>		

The Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3 :** **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2014-15:**

**Item No. 3(a) :** **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2014-15. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2014-15, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2014-15 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2014-15 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then from II<sup>nd</sup> years onward till completion of the course i.e. say II, III and IV year the fees will be Rs. 1,05,000/- per @. In case the students take V<sup>th</sup> years for completing the course then he shall pay the fee approved in that year. Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**BAMS-PG**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	BAMSPG 0007	Sumatibai Shah Ayurved College, Hadapsar, Pune	140000	147000	<b>154000</b>	161610

**BAMS**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	BAMS0005	Sumatibai Shah Ayurved College, Hadapsar, Pune	120000	126000	<b>132000</b>	148924

**BSCN**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands	
1	BSCN 0019	Swatantra Senani Uttamraoji Patil Nursing College, Aurangabad	BSCN	50000	52500	<b>40000</b>	75000
			PBSCN	65000	68250	<b>50000</b>	

**Note :** R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 1 year can be charged.

**Note:** The fee approved, for above courses is subject to affiliation/permission from respective Authorities.

**Note:** *\*Additional fee to be collected from all students of the course except those admitted in the year 2014-15.*

**Item No. 3(b):** To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/Institutes.

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

#### RANM

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	RANM0017	Helen Rose School of Nursing, Yavatmal	60000	63000	<b>66000</b>	68737
2	RANM0102	Shri. Dharehwari Nursing School (RANM), Aurangabad	69000	72450	<b>72950</b>	72956
3	RANM0228	N.M. Wadia Hospital School of Nursing, Pune	39320 Collected	-	<b>39000</b>	39000
4	RANM0405	Tanishq School of Nursing, Nagpur	60990	64040	<b>67000</b>	100806
5	RANM/RGNM0412	S. Chandra Nursing College RANM/RGNM, Gondia	65600	68880	<b>65600</b>	120144

6	RANM0425	Matoshri Asarabai Darade School of RANM Nursing, Yeola, Nashik	75000	78750	<b>82000</b>	118681
7	RANM0428	Matoshri School of RANM Nursing, Babhulgaon, Nashik	80000	84000	<b>88000</b>	118689
8	RANM0544	Mungsaji Maharaj Nursing School, Yavatmal	60000	63000	<b>60000</b>	75000
9	RANM0546	Swatantra Senani Uttamraoji Patil Nursing College, Aurangabad	60000	63000	<b>40000</b>	65000

**RGNM**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	RGNM0017	Helen Rose School of Nursing, Yavatmal	47000	49350	<b>52000</b>	73664
2	RGNM0213	Bharati Vidyapeeth College of Nursing, Pune	52000	54600	<b>40000</b>	-
3	RGNM0216	Mauli Nursing School (RGNM), Parbhani	60600	63630	<b>63800</b>	63804

**Note :** *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 1 year can be charged.*

**Note:** *The fee approved, for above courses is subject to affiliation/permission from respective Authorities.*

**Note:** *\*Additional fee to be collected from all students of the course except those admitted in the year 2014-15.*

**Item No. 4:** To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2014-15.

**1)BHMS0020: Motiwala Homeopathic Medical College, Nashik.**

Heard the Institute.

It is prayed that they may be allowed to withdraw the revision. Allowed to withdraw.



**2)BAMS0026: Mahadeorao Shivankar Ayurved Medical College, Kudwa, Gondiya.**

Heard the Institute.

It is prayed for withdrawal of this revision, as there is some technical difficulty. It is further prayed that they may be allowed to file fresh, if necessary. Allowed to withdraw with liberty.

**3)MDMS0001/: K.J.Somaiya Medical College & Research Centre. MBBS0001**

Heard the Institute.

It is prayed for withdrawal of this revision as there is some technical difficulty. It is further prayed that they may be allowed to file fresh, if necessary. Allowed to withdraw with liberty.

**4)BAMS0027: Jupiter Ayurvedic Medical College, Khamia Road, Nagpur.**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is a challenging the approval of fee of Rs. 1,00,260/- for the course started during 2014-15. The fee approved for the course started during 2013-14 was Rs. 95,000/-. The college has originally demanded Rs. 1,79,000/-. The point raise is regarding deduction made in respect of salary. There is some substance in it. The college has now given letter dated 22/1/2015 that the fee may be approved at Rs. 1,05,000/-. We feel this is reasonable. We approve the same. Office to make corrected declaration.

**5)BAMS0016: Dada Saheb Surupsingh Naik Ayurvedic College, Nagaon Dhule.**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is a challenging the fee declared for the course started during 2014-15 at Rs. 58,500/-. The fee demanded was Rs. 1,00,000/-. Two points are raised.

It is submitted that 52 students left the college. They paid only part fees during 2013-14. The balance payment came to about Rs. 50.74 lac. It is not paid. It is also pointed out that there was no admission during 2013-14. Therefore this should have been taken into consideration while considering the divisor factor. There is some substance in this. The college has now given letter dated 20/5/2015 stating that their fee may be approved at Rs. 87,000/-. We approve the same . Office to declare it.



**Item No. 5(i): To consider and decide on the Affidavit dated 10/3/2014 received from Dr. Nitin Sancheti regarding incorrect tuition fees charged by PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar & also refund of tuition fees of 3 1/2 years. (Ref: Item No. 4(i) of minutes 22/12/2014).**

Considered the letter dated 1/11/2014 of the student by name Mr. Nitish Nitin Sancheti in reply to the letter dated 29/4/2014 of the Medical College. It is his case that he was required to pay Rs. 11,00,000/- in cash for getting "No Objection Certificate" from the College for enabling him to change the college. He joined this college in 2011-12 course. He wanted the change to the Government College in the 2<sup>nd</sup> year but the college asked him to make the payment for getting the said "No Objection Certificate". The college has denied receipt of Rs. 11,00,000/- from the student. But the student has produced the pass book entries of his father Mr. Nitin Vijaykumar Sancheti of IDBI Bank Aurangabad. It shows that Rs. 10,00,000/- were deposited in cash on 14/3/2013, Rs. 75,000/- in cash on the same day and further Rs. 30,000/- in cash on that date. The amount of Rs. 11,00,000/- was withdrawn at Ahmednagar in cash on 14/3/2013. It is the case of the student that this amount was paid to the college which is situated at Ahmednagar on 14/3/2013 and thereafter the "No Objection Certificate" was issued. This circumstantial evidence proves the case of the student. The reply of the college dated 29/4/2014 shows that he joined the course during 2011-12 after passing Asso-CET. He appeared for the November/ December 2012 exam in first MBBS examination. He was declared pass and entered 2<sup>nd</sup> year MBBS course in the month of Feb 2013. He paid tuition fee of Rs. 4,00,000/- for 2011-12 and Rs. 4,20,000/- for 2012-13 i.e. 2<sup>nd</sup> year. This shows that the amount of 2<sup>nd</sup> year fee was fully paid.

But the information brochure of AMUPMDC (Asso-CET) shows that there can be no refund after the cut off date and the student has to pay Tuition fee for entire course. In the present case it is not the case of any party, whether the seat remained vacant or it was filled. Normally it remains vacant. In the circumstances the student would not be entitled to get any refund assuming that the payment was made. Further it is not stated by the student to whom the payment was made or who demanded the amount. The statement in that regard is silent. Therefore it is not possible to grant any relief to the student. Office to communicate.



**Item No. 5(ii): To consider and decide on letter dated 19/12/2014 received from Padmashree Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation's Institute of Nursing Education replies in furtherance of a Ref. Item No. 4(i) of minutes 1/12/2014.**

Considered the reply of the institute dated 19/12/2014 in view of our resolution dated 1/12/2014. The facts were mentioned in it. The college has now pointed out in the reply as under:-

*"(f) However , the Management on humanitarian grounds took a lenient view & granted 50% concession on the balance tuition fees.*

*(g) Accordingly she has to pay Rs. 55,350/- (Rupees: Fifty Five Thousand Three Hundred Fifty Only) and has been communicated to her parents." Clean, this was done, considering the reason regarding cancellation of admission . Refund is possible under the rules only if admission is cancelled before cut off date. Considering this we find nothing wrong in the reply . We reject the complaint. Office to communicate.*

**Item No. 5(iii): To consider and decide on letter dated 18/12/2014 received from KDA Nursing College regarding fees structure for Basic B.Sc. Nursing also as only for Post Basic B.Sc. Nursing fees is declared for the AY 2014-15.**

Considering the letter dated 18/12/2014. Office to correct the declaration dated 11/11/2014 as under:

**PBSCN**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
4	PBSCN & B.SCN 0031	KDA Nursing College, Andheri, Mumbai	78000	81900	<b>78000</b>	78000

Office to declare it.

**Item No. 6: Any other matter with the permission of the Chair.**

Nil

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Tuesday** the **3<sup>rd</sup>** of **February 2015** at **11:00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date:

23-1-15

**(P.S. PATANKAR)**  
**CHAIRMAN**